

## Analysis of the Factors Affecting the Implementation of Communicative Language Teaching Approach in Pakistani Private and Public Institutions

Rehan Muhammad<sup>a</sup>, Choudhry Shahid<sup>b</sup>, Taimoor A.A. Gurmani<sup>c</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Lecturer, Department of English & Deputy Registrar, Emerson University Multan.

<sup>b</sup> Associate Professor, Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences, University of Sialkot.

<sup>c</sup> Assistant Professor, Department of English, Institute of Southern Punjab, Multan.

**Corresponding author's email:** [ch.shahid70@gmail.com](mailto:ch.shahid70@gmail.com)

**Received:** 12 January 2023, **Published:** 19 March 2023

### Abstract:

The primary purpose of this research was to investigate the factors affecting communicative approach implementation at the tertiary level as a methodology to teach and learn English as a second language. Communicative language teaching is the most widely used pedagogical approach for teaching foreign languages in developed countries (CLT). Pakistan's educational system may be divided into two main categories: English and Urdu medium. In this study, both literature and situational analysis were employed. Research papers published from 2015 to 2022 were part of the study for critical analysis. Teachers in Pakistan should consider societal aspects and cultural elements and adapt the CLT accordingly. Teachers of English in Pakistani public and private institutions are asked to adapt CLT methodologies to local conditions in light of a paradigm for teaching English using conventional methods. Students may find it easier to participate in the teaching process and accept responsibility for their studies if they are taught using this approach, which also has the potential to improve how English is currently taught in public and private institutions.

### Keywords:

CLT, Teaching English in Pakistan, Higher Education, Students Engagement, Autonomy.

**DOI Number:** [10.47067/jlcc.v5i1.164](https://doi.org/10.47067/jlcc.v5i1.164)

## **Introduction:**

### ***Background of the Study:***

In recent years, Communicative Language Teaching (CLT) has gained the most significant traction in language teaching in countries with advanced economies. On the contrary, McKay (2012) asserts that CLT use is very unusual in developing countries. In addition, the CLT represents Western ideas and ideals, which often conflict with the existing circumstance of the swotting method to develop a nation. Furthermore, CLT is a discipline that calls for experimental research and places an incredible amount of weight on the ideas and activities that its originators and academics mentioned. In this regard, the CLT research studies that have been carried out have mirrored the perspectives and points of view held by the instructors and students (Abrar et al., 2018). However, the perspectives and judgments of students and instructors at the post-secondary level have only been the focus of a few research studies (Aftab et al., 2014). Panhwar et al. (2017) investigated CLT in Pakistan did so, but the students they focused on were students at the university level. Even though these studies show that collaboration improves academic communication and language learning, the researchers have encountered several managerial challenges. This study aims to evaluate whether socially adaptable CLT systems, such as autonomous learning and student engagement through CLT, may assist instructors in better managing an extensive range of students in classes and enhance their communicative learning.

### ***Statement of the Problem:***

Pakistan has two separate educational systems: the English learning curriculum and the Urdu curriculum (Albahri et al., 2018). Urdu is the primary language of teaching at schools supported by the state, but English is the primary language of instruction in private schools focused on student learning.

According to Goddard et al. (2017), the standards and student performance in public and private institutions are characterized by their competence in oral and written communication in English. The high level of society, as well as many different working-class groups, are considered by English-language schools that provide teaching in institutions. It is interesting to note that most of the publicly supported Urdu educational organizations that facilitate gratis schooling to the students of impoverished households are secondary schools. Classrooms at private schools are often very well supplied, which contributes to the high level of instruction that can be found in such institutions. Students' independent learning can assist educators in putting theory into practice and enhance their communicative competence (Gurmani, Latiff, et al., 2023; Abbasi et al., 2022; Shahid et al., 2022). Students with excellent knowledge also learn English in their homes, making them more adept at the level than those who attend public schools. Children who have first-class knowledge also study English at home. Public schools have few resources, which contributes to students' poor English language skills outside the classroom (Fenton-Smith et al., 2017). Students in Pakistani institutions were found to struggle

to acquire communicative competence, and there exists a gap in their skill development; language deficiency, poor assessment, and faulty pedagogies are the main factors for low student proficiency in English language learning (Shahid et al., 2020).

### **Literature Review:**

Students are encouraged to improve their language skills via the use of CLT. The ability of a learner to use all four skills simultaneously, namely reading, writing, listening, and speaking, is referred to as a communicative ability or skill. According to Bhatti and Memon (2016), the fundamental underlying knowledge and talent for language that the speaker and listener have can be defined as communication skills. Additionally, to enhance students' communicative skills, they must grasp the language used to discuss the issue at hand and use it cohesively.

Rather than treating the two aspects of language separately, the CLT, as stated by Chen and Kraklow (2015), systematically considers both the structural and functional aspects of language and then combines them. Students who participate in activities that improve their communication skills are better able to connect and communicate with others, regardless of the communication they speak. Students' autonomy in language learning is their responsibility and helps them identify their strengths and weaknesses (Shahid et al., 2022). Conventional activities, on the other hand, provide instructors with more authority to instruct. In contrast, the communication activities emphasize the students as the primary players and reduce the significance of the instructor's contribution (Doman & Webb, 2017).

As a worldwide language and a language used for communication between the government and its citizens, English has a large amount of significance in Pakistan. English has often shown its commitment to advancing socioeconomic status by demonstrating the need to do so and establishing its necessity (Muhammad, 2016). The main hurdles in learning the English language are the less motivation, lack of vocabulary, and teaching methodology that play a role in learning English as a second language (Gurmani, Latiff, et al., 2022; Gurmani, Salmani, et al., 2022).

Since then, in the educational institutions of Pakistan, ranging from elementary schools to higher education facilities, for instance, schools and colleges, it has become a required topic. Although, since Pakistan's independence, English has been spoken most of the time. In Pakistan, not many factors make it possible or desirable to teach English there. According to Iwashita (2012), children have difficulty communicating in English even though learning English is a compulsory subject beginning in the first grade. This is especially true for students from more rural sections of the country. They report deficiencies in each of the four areas of language proficiencies. In Pakistan, the primary reason for this in terms of teaching and learning is that the techniques employed to progress the English language are inadequately communicative. This has resulted in the situation described above.

In Pakistan, students may study English as a second language or as a foreign tongue. According to Rashid (2018), English becomes the second language for many who use their national language, Urdu, as their first language; however, for those who speak other languages as their primary ones, such as Sindhi, Pashto, and Punjabi, Urdu is used as a second language for them, and English has become a foreign dialect. In Pakistan, whether or not learning a foreign language is required, the English language programs in this context cannot comply with the

goals established in the module (Rashid, 2018). Teachers do not have access to modern teaching techniques or enough training in their field. The vast majority of English language teachers use outdated ways of learning and reading materials that are illogically redundant to teach English to students learning English as a foreign or second language. The marks for considering the possibility of learning English are below average and do not incorporate contemporary testing and evaluation techniques (Savignon, 2018).

The outcomes in language learning are below the mark, and there is a need to revamp the methodologies and syllabus and consider students' backgrounds and limitations (Akmal et al., 2022; Shahid, Asif, Muhammad, 2022; Shahid, Abbasi, & Gurmani, 2022; Shahid, Ong, et al., 2019).

Except for subjects directly related to language study, all classes at higher education institutions, including colleges and universities, are given in English as the teaching medium (Solak & Bayar, 2015). In addition, students attending Pakistani secondary schools, colleges, and universities are expected to take a course in English, which is taught alongside other essential courses like literature and language. Anyhow, at these cutting-edge educational institutions, English teachers do not shift to the standard teaching style they were taught using the CLT-based communication tactics necessary for teaching (Zeeshan, 2013). Private Colleges and universities around Pakistan do a better job of teaching English.

A variety of English classes, including "functional English," TEFL (Teaching of English as a Foreign Language), TESOL (Teaching of English to the Speakers of Other Language), EAP (English for Academic Purposes), and ESP (English for Specific Purposes), are available at privately funded colleges as well as those that are funded by the state. Most students attending public institutions are either still in high school or have not completed high school; hence, ESL and functional English programs are designed to improve students' poor English language skills. For this reason, ESL and functional English programs are considered vital in educating students to fulfil the requirements of higher education (Orlova, 2018).

### **Research Objective:**

The primary goal of this research is to explore and understand the implementation of communicative Language Teaching (CLT) at the Tertiary level in public and private institutions in Pakistan.

### **Research Question:**

What factors affect the implementation of communicative Language Teaching (CLT) approach at the tertiary level in Pakistan in public and private institutions to teach the English language?

### **Importance of the Study:**

The vast majority of students in Pakistan are enrolled in schools run by the state; nevertheless, the researcher is unaware of any independent research on English teaching outside the school mentioned above. This research is carried out at the third level, which is more significant at the university level for the development of learning capacities in students. Moreover, despite English being the country's official language, students in schools that the government manages get a substandard education in the language.

On the other hand, students who attend English-language schools considered to be of the highest caliber are exposed to every approach employed to teach the language. Since of this, affluent people are included because they have easy access to top occupations, which may be somewhat compensated for their competence in the English language.

As a consequence, wealthy people are included. According to the findings of this research, individuals of all different kinds and ages should use the most effective learning and teaching strategies. This principle serves as the investigation's guiding philosophy.

### **Research Methodology:**

This qualitative study used a literature review and situational analysis to collect and analyze the most important factors affecting students' English language learning in Pakistani higher education institutions. The study is based on reviews and summaries of previous studies that focus on pedagogical practices and issues in language teaching and learning, particularly in Pakistan and other nations where English is taught as a foreign language (EFL) setting. Document analysis was used as the research method in this study, which falls under the qualitative paradigm (Bowen, 2009). Situation analysis, organized review, and thematic evaluation are used to determine what influences students' communication and learner autonomy in Pakistani higher education. According to Ferreday & Muir-Cochrane (2006), the entire process involved reading and analyzing to discover the themes and classify them accordingly. From 2015 to 2022, this study looks at critical analysis papers.

### **Critical Review and Analysis:**

The major themes were revealed by reviewing the papers: low proficiency, inadequate evaluation, and problematic pedagogy are all signs of a skill gap. Teachers and students alike value English language communication skills, but the lack of an evaluation system makes it impossible to concentrate more effectively, and socioeconomic factors also impede EFL students' skill development. The education system in Pakistan has two distinct strands Urdu and English (Albahri et al., 2018). According to Blond (2015), p. 23, private schools are considered significant due to their emphasis on English communication skills among students. When compared to public institutions, private institutions provide higher-quality education. Private schools have well-kept classrooms equipped with cutting-edge language teaching technology; these institutions offer private English language instruction at home to their students. As a result, they stand out in terms of their proficiency in language learning (Fenton-Smith et al., 2017). The specifics of the thematic analysis and the findings of this study, which was carried out in the context of English as a Foreign Language, are provided in the following paragraphs.

### **Student Involvement:**

According to Kavanoz et al. (2015), one of the most important aspects of CLT is cultivating classroom participation and communication among students. This precondition for cooperative learning in the classroom offers a vital and cutting-edge foundation for expanding classroom instruction outside the confines of the classroom. Because of this, students can put their learning into practice not just in the classroom but also in other settings. The activities and exercises for teaching communicative language need to be developed to simulate actual

concurrency concerns and emphasize communicative learning in the classroom. It is not usually a significant characteristic of CLT that students work together in the classroom.

Educators should generally become familiar with ways to improve communication beyond the present reality's constraints (Orlova, 2018). Students should be given access to the same real-world students and communication channels to allow them to use the language in scenarios in which they may contextualize and consult. Teachers should do this (Abdullah, 2018). Social cooperation among students makes the process of learning a language more accessible. When students work in groups of students or pairs, they can practice their language abilities via conversation and reflection, making learning a language simpler (Abrar et al., 2018). Surprisingly, the enormous number of students enrolled in English as a Second Language (ESL) programs in developing countries like Pakistan limits students from enhancing their capacity to absorb languages intimately tied to local affiliations (JEONG, 2018). Because of the increased class numbers and the instructors' frequent use of a well-known discussion technique (Kavanov et al., 2015), students hardly ever get the chance to participate in intuitive activities with one another. Students overlook the growth in attractiveness and user involvement to concentrate on studying, coordinating, improving each other's knowledge, and further developing their communication language and social ties (Darling-Hammond & Cook-Harvey, 2018).

#### ***Students' interest and confidence in the target language:***

Pakistani students' language proficiency level is lower than that of students in other Asian countries. Pakistan is ranked 50th out of 86 countries in the region and 12th out of 21 countries in Asia in the EF English Proficiency Index (2018). According to the British Council (2015), there is no systematic approach to teaching language at the university level, which hinders students' progress and results in little improvement in language learning. Additionally, the proficiency level of teachers is open to debate regarding knowledge and competence. At the tertiary level, text-based activities still dominate traditional language instruction.

According to the British Council report from 2015, more research is needed to fill in the gaps and verify the statistics to find out how university students in Pakistan are developing their communicative competence.

#### ***English as a Skill in Pakistan:***

According to the Employer Skill Survey (2013), many university graduates lack the fundamental skills required by their professions and potential employers. More than 500000 graduates are unemployed in Pakistan, according to a report from the Bureau of Statistics division published in the daily Dawn newspaper on March 18, 2018. Economic conditions, a lack of communication, and self-management abilities, which employers in Pakistan highly value in graduates, all contribute to unemployment (Abbasi, 2018; Saeed & Rashidi, 2017). According to a report from the Federal Public Service Commission of Pakistan (FPSC) published in the daily Dawn on December 6, 2016, 92 percent of graduate and postgraduate level students failed the competitive examination for public service in Pakistan in English. All of the students were from prestigious Pakistani universities. The fact that so many students failed the highly competitive exam demonstrates that English language instruction in Pakistani universities is failing.

### ***Language Assessment and Evaluation:***

According to Shamim (2017), Pakistan's demand for English requires systematic evaluation and discussion. She added that the education system and teaching methods should be reevaluated because they focus on exam-based content and do not allow students to develop their literacy skills or effectively use language in or outside the classroom. According to Hameed and Tahir (2016), the most important aspects of language instruction are the teaching beliefs, approach, and syllabus. Teachers should also set high goals to meet their students' challenging requirements.

The evaluation system in Pakistani institutions is flawed due to several factors (Ahmad & Malik, 2011), many of which are external, and language learning assessment is a crucial component. Context, teaching techniques, and recognizing accomplishment, whereas internal is; attitude, personal ability, beliefs, and motivation. According to Khattak (2012), students who lack English proficiency cannot achieve their academic goals, leading to a high failure rate in schools, colleges, and universities.

### ***English as the symbol of intelligence and social status:***

Learning English is associated with power and status in Pakistani society; it is a means of advancement within the elite class, a skill for employability, and an essential component of a graduate's personality. According to Muhammad (2011), proficiency in English is essential for academic and social success in Pakistan's education system (Ahmad & Rao, 2012). According to Dreyfus et al. (2016), despite English's academic, social, and historical significance in Pakistan, students struggle to learn the language, which hinders their academic abilities. According to Svignon (2017), teachers should combine form and function in the classroom to enhance students' communicative competence due to the language's interactive nature.

Although language is viewed as an individual cognitive action, it is a social endeavor jointly constructed through classroom activities and practice. Rasheed et al. (2017) say that teachers should play their part in involving students in this learning endeavor (Khan, 2016). An area that ought to be investigated to measure learning outcomes and determine what kind of support English language teachers provide to students to improve the situation of language learning in Pakistan is how English language teachers materialize their theory of teaching (Iqbal & Bhatti, 2017).

### ***Student Autonomy:***

Students are freed from an unnecessary dependency on teachers when a CLT strategy, such as group or pair work, is used in their educational experience (Aftab et al., 2014). As a direct consequence, they accept personal accountability for their educational learning. In this way, it increases the level of motivation that they possess. Students have more say over their learning thanks to CLT. A teacher's only responsibility should be to function as a guide, provide recommendations, and understand various communication activities. It is up to him to dissuade the students from taking control of the situation. "It also becomes obvious that these processes may operate without any form of a teacher at all, given that the environment gives the right stimuli and experience," the author says, "if we look at foreign language learning as it occurs in the natural world" (Akcan, 2016, P. 34). According to Kavanoz et al. (2015), students who

feel valued are more driven, make the most of possibilities to exhibit their personality and make connections with people in their enclosing. Consequently, one of the requirements of CLT is to ensure that students have access to an environment where they can feel respected as people and safe.

### **Situational Analysis:**

Even though the CLT is widely considered an essential instrument for developing the environment necessary for developing communicative capabilities and the skills necessary for day-to-day communication, its implementation in developing countries is not particularly prevalent. Albahri et al. (2018) discovered that the conflict with the local learning culture might be the single most relevant variable besides political, linguistic, infrastructural, and other financial considerations. Employing traditional teaching practices, which advocate for making students feel comfortable and secluded in the classroom, is the most significant social problem that negatively influences the implementation of CLT in state construction. This is because these practices were developed decades ago. According to Bland (2015), educational methodologies originate from social and social systems.

Similarly, use any of these methodologies in a surrounding where they have not been established. As stated by Fenton-Smith et al. (2017), CLT should not be seen as just a rapid collection of possible tactics to use in the classroom setting. Educators in places like Pakistan need to put in extra time and energy to develop, from scratch, communicative-based teaching strategies that work in their context. According to Bhatti and Memon (2016), it is improbable that Hanoi will be able to adopt the CLT in a way comparable to that of London.

As stated by Chen and Kraklow (2015), practical techniques that emphasize group-based autonomous work for independent learning communication must be found to address and regulate CLT-related difficulties in classrooms. These methods must be able to be implemented even without the direct involvement of the teachers. Bottom-up systems, in which policymakers and other so-called "experts" pass the law on how the best way to teach a language should be taught, have reportedly lost their validity (Kavanoz et al., 2015).

Instead, cooperative learning techniques are an area that warrants more investigation (Humphries & Burns, 2015). Every instructor is very knowledgeable in the subject matter they impart to their students. However, they may also absorb ideas from others, such as instructors, philosophers, and researchers, and then analyze those insights in a given circumstance. Theory, research, and practice function together on the premise of equality is a fundamentally important need for successful teaching standards and techniques (Helm, 2015). Therefore, teachers at Pakistani institutions must research relevant issues, change their lessons, and use CLT strategies. Promptly using CLT strategies without reasonable modifications might lead to management and control problems.

According to Kavanoz et al., (2015), the adoption of CLT in many countries cannot be halted (save in those places where it has already begun) since CLT goes against society. If the system does not accept new and cutting-edge methods of teaching language, it will not be able to keep up with the advances in language teaching (Chen & Kraklow, 2015). The concept that the CLT methodology is a particularly successful approach to teaching and learning a language is supported by a general statement about the CLT methodology. The following argument



suggests that the CLT's implementation needs to be improved rather than scrapped altogether. According to Orlova (2018), even if CLT is not implemented in the same way as in Western nations, it may still be feasible to have the intended results in other communities and countries with some further development and adjustment.

In most cases, the instructor will be able to divide the content into more manageable, shorter communication chunks and convey it using a range of different communication methods that have been appropriately set up. The letter recommends investigating the matter and, if required, making adjustments to the CLT methods (Helm, 2015).

According to Humphries and Burns (2015), a case study may shed light on how teachers might support their students in mastering a language program and figuring out how to fulfil their logical requirements. Consequently, it may motivate both students and learners to advocate for changes that include improvement and revitalization. It is essential to investigate the perspectives of both teachers and students in order to successfully differentiate between theory and practice (JEONG, 2018). The alteration of instructor behavior and experience with CLT is the most significant factor in achieving the most remarkable possible effectiveness in implementing CLT (Hamid et al., 2013).

Most of the failure in the English language is attributed to teaching methods and other contributing factors; lack of teachers training, poor vocabulary, lack of confidence, hesitation to speak, and use of Urdu and the other regional languages in the classrooms have affected the teachers and students learning (Gurmani et al., 2021; Yusoff et al., 2022).

### **Conclusion:**

This study aimed to investigate and demonstrate the current state of English teaching in public and private institutions in Pakistan. Examining the factors that led to the failure of CLT strategies, such as the prevalence of group-based work and other forms of instructive activities in Pakistan, and demonstrating that CLT is not a methodology that should be implemented worldwide are necessary steps in this process. However, the CLT is considered a methodology that must be altered to satisfy the requirements of the contexts in which it is employed. This is because the CLT is applied in a wide variety of settings. This is an endeavor to clarify CLT in prestigious institutions teaching language in Pakistan.

Educators in Pakistan have to consider societal and relevant cultural aspects in Pakistan. The analyses show that the advantages and disadvantages of using CLT for public and private are equally feasible, and they should adapt the CLT as required. Instead of immediately putting CLT techniques into practice, the language instructors at the institutions in Pakistan have been asked to study their surroundings and situations and modify CLT methods accordingly. This is because there is a model for teaching English via conventional teaching tactics, such as considering pertinent needs, such as a lack of training and packed courses.

In addition to assisting students in becoming more involved in the teaching process and accepting responsibility for their academic work, this mode of instruction has the potential to improve how English is currently taught in academic institutions. Because they are mature adults, university students are in a better position to conveniently prepare for managing the use of various CLT strategies, such as autonomous learning and student engagement.

## References:

- Abbasi, I. A., Shahid, C., & Shah, S. H. R. (2022). An Investigation of the Factors Contributing to Inadequate Listening Comprehension in Non-Elite Private Secondary Schools, Punjab, Pakistan. *Pakistan Languages and Humanities Review*, 6(2), 633-646.
- Abdullah, F. (2018). Social actors in an Intercultural Communication classroom: A discursive lens of intercultural education. *Indonesian JELT*, 13(1), 31-51.
- Abrar, M., Mukminin, A., Habibi, A., Asyraf, F., Makmur, M., & Marzulina, L. (2018). "If our English isn't a language, what is it?" Indonesian EFL Student Teachers' Challenges Speaking English. *The Qualitative Report*, 23(1), 129-145.
- Aftab, A., Qureshi, S., & William, I. (2014). Investigating the washback effect of the Pakistani Intermediate English Examination. *International Journal of English and Literature*, 5(7), 149-154.
- Akcan, S. (2016). A Novicenon-native English teachers' reflections ontheir teacher education programmes and their first years of teaching. *Profile Issues in Teachers Professional Development*, 18(1), 55-70.
- Akmal, F., Shahid, C., & Abbasi, I., A., (2022). Globalization in the Educational Culture of Punjab Public Secondary Schools. *Global Sociological Review*, 7(1), 203-209
- Akmal, F., Shahid, C., & Ahmed, M., (2022). Knowledge-related Attained Learning Outcomes Gaps Detection and Resolution of BS Graduates. *Global Educational Studies Review*, VII (II), 533-544.
- Albahri, M. A., Yang, P., & Moustakim, M. (2018). Saudi Arabian tertiary teachers' and learners' attitude towards the "Communicative Language Teaching (CLT)".*International Journal of Information and Education Technology*, 8(4),317- 321.
- Bhatti, N., & Memon, S. (2016). Investigating the Perceptions of Pakistani English Language Learners on Language Learning Anxiety in EFL Classroom. *Advances in Language and Literary Studies*, 7(5), 23-34.
- Bland, J. (Ed.). (2015). *Teaching English to young learners: critical issues in language teaching with 3-12 year olds*. Bloomsbury Publishing.
- Chen, Y. L. E., & Kraklow, D. (2015). Taiwanese college students' motivation and engagement for English learning in the context of internationalization at home: A comparison of students in EMI and Non-EMI programs. *Journal of studies in International Education*, 19(1), 46-64.
- Choudhry S., Ishfaq, A. A., Muhammad, T. G. (2022): English as a Second Language Teachers and Students Beliefs about Learner Autonomy at Tertiary Level in Pakistan *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences* Volume 10, Number 1, 2022, Pages 149-161 Journal Homepage: <https://journals.internationalrasd.org/index.php/pjhss>
- Darling-Hammond, L., & Cook-Harvey, C. M. (2018). Educating the Whole Child: Improving School Climate to Support Student Success. *Learning Policy Institute*.

- Doman, E., & Webb, M. (2017). The flipped experience for Chinese university students studying English as a foreign language. *TESOL Journal*, 8(1), 102-141.
- Fenton-Smith, B., Humphreys, P., & Walkinshaw, I. (2017). *English medium instruction in higher education in Asia-Pacific*. Springer International Publishing.
- Goddard, R. D., Skrla, L., & Salloum, S. J. (2017). The role of collective efficacy in closing student achievement gaps: A mixed methods study of school leadership for excellence and equity. *Journal of education for students placed at risk (JESPAR)*, 22(4), 220-236.
- Gurmani, M. T. A., LATIFF, A. A., Shahid, C., Abbasi, I. A., & Bhutto, A. A. (2022). Whatsapp and An Academic Wordlist (Awl) Have A Synergistic Impact On L2 Vocabulary Learners. *Webology (ISSN: 1735-188X)*, 19(2), 5785-5805.
- Gurmani, M. T., Latiff, A. A., Abbasi, I. A., & Jatoi, Z. A., Shahid, C. (2023). Examining Vocabulary Usage Ratios of CEFR Vocabulary and AWL vocabulary in Comparison to CEFR Proficiency Levels among Pakistani EFL Writers and Offering Instructional Recommendations for Vocabulary Items. *Central European Management Journal*, 31(1), 266-274
- Gurmani, M. T., Salmani, F. C., Shahid, C., Abbasi, I. A., & Ali, A. (2022). The effect of the British National Corpus' Frequency Lists What's App Group Discussion on L2 Learners' Receptive Vocabulary Size. *Central European Management Journal*, 30(4), 1004-1014.
- Gurmani, M. T. A., Yusoff, Z. S., & Shahid, C. (2021). an evaluation of vocabulary of english textbooks of pakistan and saudi arabia through cefr. *PalArch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt/Egyptology*, 18(10), 3375-3387.
- Hamid, M. O., Jahan, I., & Islam, M. M. (2013). Medium of instruction policies and language practices, ideologies and institutional divides: Voices of teachers and students in a private university in Bangladesh. *Current Issues in Language Planning*, 14(1), 144-163.
- Helm, F. (2015). The practices and challenges of tele-collaboration in higher education in Europe. *Language Learning & Technology*, 19(2), 197-217.
- Humphries, S., & Burns, A. (2015). 'In reality it's almost impossible': CLT-oriented curriculum change. *ELT journal*, 69(3), 239-248.
- Iqbal, S., & Bhatti, Z. A. (2017). What drives m-learning? An empirical investigation of university student perceptions in Pakistan. *Higher Education Research & Development*, 36(4), 730-746.
- Jeong, K. O. (2018). developing efl learners' communicative competence through multimedia-assisted language learning. *Journal of Theoretical & Applied Information Technology*, 96(5).
- Kavanoz, S., Yüksel, H. G., & Özcan, E. (2015). Pre-service teachers' self-efficacy perceptions on Web Pedagogical Content Knowledge. *Computers & Education*, 85, 94-101.
- McKay, S. L. (2012). Teaching materials for English as an international language. *Principles and practices of teaching English as an international language*, 3(9), 70-83.
- Muhammad, Z. (2016). Pakistani Government Secondary Schools Students' Attitudes towards

- Communicative Language Teaching and Grammar Translation in Quetta, Balochistan. *English Language Teaching*, 9(3), 258-270.
- Ngoc, K. M., & Iwashita, N. O. R. I. K. O. (2012). A comparison of learners' and teachers' attitudes toward communicative language teaching at two universities in Vietnam. *University of Sydney Papers in TESOL*, 7.
- Orlova, N. (2018). English language teaching at the tertiary education level: syllabus types and design. *Cherkasy University Bulletin: Pedagogical Sciences*, (1).
- Panhwar, A. H., Baloch, S., & Khan, S. (2017). Making communicative language teaching work in Pakistan. *International Journal of English Linguistics*, 7(3), 226-234.
- Rashid, S. (2018). The effect of training in Mobile Assisted Language Learning on attitude, beliefs and practices of tertiary students in Pakistan.
- Savignon, S. J. (2018). Communicative competence. *The TESOL encyclopedia of English language teaching*, 1-7.
- Shahid Choudhry, Ong Eng Tek, Wong Kung Teck and Asma Perveen (2020): Academic Motivation and Self-Efficacy of Teachers and Students in Higher Secondary Level in Pakistan: *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Sciences* <http://hrmars.com/index.php/papers/detail/IJARBSS/6739>
- Shahid, C., Abbasi, I. A., & Asif, S., (2022). Factors Affecting Secondary Level Students' Goal Achievement Performance and Self-Worth in L2 Learning in Pakistan: *Global Language Review*, VII(I), 310-324
- Shahid, C., Abbasi, I. A., & Bhutto, S. (2022). Improving Communicative Competence through CLT Approach in Second Language Learning at the Undergraduate Level. *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 10(4), 1472-1486.
- Shahid, C., Abbasi, I. A., & Gurmani, M. T. (2022). English as a Second Language Teachers and Students Beliefs about Learner Autonomy at Tertiary Level in Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 10(1), 149-161.
- Shahid, C., Abbasi, I. A., & Gurmani, M. T. (2022). English as a Second Language Teachers and Students Beliefs about Learner Autonomy at Tertiary Level in Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 10(1), 149-161.
- Shahid, C., Ali, A., Akmal, F., & Arif, M. (2022). Assessment of Knowledge of Instructional Planning and Strategies Of Prospective Teachers. *PalArch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt/Egyptology*, 19(4), 439-448.
- Shahid, C., Asif, S., Muhammad., R., (2022). Pedagogies and Challenges in English Language Learning in Undergraduate Programs in Pakistan: A Review. *Global Language Review*, 7(2), 479-488.
- Shahid, C., Muhammed, G. A., Abbasi, I. A., Gurmani, M. T., & ur Rahman, S. (2022). Attitudes of Undergraduates and Teachers Towards Evolving Autonomous Learning L2 In Higher Education. *Journal of Positive School Psychology*, 6(11), 527-544. Ahmed, M.,
- Solak, E., & Bayar, A. (2015). Current Challenges in English Language Learning in Turkish EFL

Context. *Online Submission*, 2(1),106-115.

Yusoff, Z. S., Gurmani, M. T. A., Sanif, S., & Noor, S. N. F. M. (2022). The Effect of Mobile-Assisted CEFR English Vocabulary Profile Word Lists on L2 Students' Vocabulary Knowledge. *Asian Journal of University Education*, 18(2), 526-543.

Zeeshan, M. (2013). *Pakistani government secondary school teachers' and students' attitudes towards communicative language teaching and grammar translation in Quetta, Balochistan* (Doctoral dissertation, California State University, Los Angeles).